Pros and Cons of Bilingual Education

Lyssa Newport

CHAD 260B Capstone Seminar

Presentation

Why is it important to learn more than one language?

- Approximately 50% of the world's population is bilingual
- Roughly 18% of the US population is bilingual
- In many countries in the European Union schools require students to learn two foreign languages in addition to their own native language

Historical views of bilingualism

- Bilingual children have smaller vocabularies and cognitive abilities (Arsenian, 1937)
- Bilinguals perform worse on IQ tests (Hakuta & Diaz, 1985)

 These studies did not control for variables like socioeconomic status that could effect student outcomes (Darcy, 1953)

Shift in views on bilingualism among researchers

- Peal & Lambert (1962) controlled for age, sex, socioeconomic status, included standardized measure of bilingualism
- Found that there is a cognitive advantage to bilingualism
- In the years since this study views of bilingual education have shifted from subtractive to additive views

Potential benefits of bilingualism

- <u>Cognitive</u>: executive control, memory, creativity in problem-solving
- Social: ability to distinguish contradictory emotion from content of speech, self-concept, tolerance of others
- <u>Linguistic</u>: metalinguistic awareness, concept awareness, fluency with digital texts

Research questions

- What effects does bilingual education have on cognitive development?
- What are the social effects of bilingualism on children?
- Does bilingualism benefit linguistic development?
- Does the age at which both languages were learned make a difference in the developmental outcomes?
- Does the type of linguistic and academic support received make a difference in adult bilingual fluency rates?

Results

- <u>Cognitive</u>: improved performance on conflict tasks (executive control) and cognitive flexibility
- <u>Social</u>: improved recognition of emotion in speech, tolerance, self-concept, personality
- Linguistic: metalinguistic knowledge, competence with digital texts
- Age: it is never too late, but ability to attain fluency decreases over time
- Best program: dual immersion

Mental categorization of linguistic constructs



Thierry et. al. (2009): In Greek there are separate words for "light blue" and "blue," but not for "light green" and "green."

Mental categorization of linguistic constructs



Cook et. al. (2006): In English objects are more frequently sorted by shape than by material, and in Japanese objects are more often sorted by material than by shape.

Types of bilingual education programs

	Second Language Immersion	Transitional Bilingual Programs	Structured English Immersion	Late-Exit or Developmental	Dual Language Programs
Key Components:	Low L1 support	L1 instruction for 3 years, then L2-only	60 minutes L1 instruction or less daily	Education in L1, then L2 added in	90% instruction K-1 in L2, shifts until equal
Pros:	Rapid proficiency	Transfer skills from L1 to L2	L2 curriculum largely mainstream	No loss of L1 proficiency	L1 and L2 academic proficiency
Cons:	Only supports L2 development	Emphasis only on building L2 competence	Minimal L1 support	Does not allow for great depth in L2 instruction	Requires instructors fluent in 2 languages
Best suited for:	People already fluent in L1	Building proficiency in L2 but not in L1	Building L2 proficiency but not L1 proficiency	Complete L1 competence, some L2 competence	Attaining complete fluency in L1 and L2

Historical views of bilingual education in the US

- Allowed in some areas after they were annexed, often repealed later
- Roughly half of the states in the US have adopted English as an official language
- Strong English-only movement in several regions of the US

Bilingual education in California

- Proposition 227
- 1 year Structured English Immersion or less, then mainstream English-only classroom instruction
- 1 out of 3 students in California public schools is an English language learner

Policy implications and conclusions

- Proposition 227 is not in the best interest of ELLs in California
- Native language support is necessary to improve student outcomes
- Dual language programs would produce citizens fluent in two languages at the end of their schooling, benefiting the global economy

